

# **HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**

Council Chambers, City Hall  
70 Maple Street  
Manistee, MI 49660

## **MEETING MINUTES**

May 4, 2017

A Meeting of the Manistee City Historic District Commission was held on Thursday, May 4, 2017 at 3:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers, City Hall, 70 Maple Street, Manistee, Michigan.

Meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Kracht.

### **ROLL CALL:**

**Members Present:** Aaron Bennett, Teena Kracht, Brandon David, Mary Russell

**Members Absent:** T. Eftaxiadis (excused), John Perschbacher (excused), Lee Trucks (excused)

**Others:** Chuck Haemker (Manistee County Library – 95 Maple Street), Dorothy Hayward (340 River Street), Tyler Leppanen (DDA Director), Mark Fedder (Museum Director) Steve Harold (Museum Curator) and Denise Blakeslee (Planning & Zoning Administrator) and others

### **APPROVAL OF AGENDA:**

MOTION by Mary Russell, seconded by Aaron Bennett that the Agenda be approved as prepared.

With a voice vote this motion passed unanimously

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

MOTION by Aaron Bennett, seconded by Mary Russell that the Minutes of the April 6, 2017 Meeting be approved with changes:

Correct typos on page 2; Add “or another vendor to second bullet point on top of page 3; correct typo on page 3; Remove Commissioner David as voting in favor of motion for By-Law Amendments because he was not present at the meeting.

With a voice vote this motion passed unanimously

## **PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA RELATED ITEMS**

Tyler Leppanen, DDA Director – the DDA is in full support of all the applications and none are applying for tax credits; spoke of the need for trust and strength in the local economy, two requests need approval for submission for a façade grants, deadline is tomorrow; he has reviewed the standards and noted they allow for flexibility by the commission; the subcommittee offered two options.

### **NEW BUSINESS:**

#### **HDC-2017-14 – Tracey Lindeman, 308 River Street – rear deck**

A request has been received from Tracey Lindeman, 308 River Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a covered wooden deck on the rear of the building as submitted with application HDC-2017-14. Application was deemed complete by the Commission.

Mr. Lindeman was not present and Ms. Blakeslee spoke to the commission about the request on behalf of the applicant. Mr. Lindeman may shorten the length of the deck to match the proposed covered roof and may wait to install the roof at a later date depending on financing.

Motion by Mary Russell, seconded by Brandon David that the Historic District Commission approve the request from Tracey Lindeman, 308 River Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a covered wooden deck on the rear of the building as submitted with application HDC-2017-14.

Steve Harold noted that the proposed roof is corrugated metal and that the roof on the building is hot tar.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 5 to 0.

Yes: Bennett, David, Russell, Kracht  
No: None

#### **HDC-2017-15 – Manistee County Library, 95 Maple Street – rear entrance**

A request has been received from Manistee County Library, 95 Maple Street to reconstruct the rear entrance of their building as submitted with application HDC-2017-15. Application was deemed complete by the Commission.

Chuck Haemker, Executive Director of Manistee County Library spoke to the commission about the request and answered questions.

MOTION by Aaron Bennett, seconded by Mary Russell that the Historic District Commission approve the request from Manistee County Library, 95 Maple Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness to reconstruct the rear entrance of their building as submitted with application HDC-2017-15.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 4 to 0.

Yes: Bennett, David, Russell, Kracht

No: None

#### **HDC-2017-16 – Dorothy Hayward, 340 River Street – rear windows and door replacement**

A request has been received from Dorothy Hayward, 340 River Street for rear windows and door replacement as submitted with application HDC-2017-16. Application was deemed complete by the Commission.

Ms. Hayward spoke to the Commissioners about the request and stated that she was able to find a supplier for wooden replacement windows instead of the vinyl windows that were submitted with the application. Mark Fedder reviewed the windows and there were no distinguishing characteristics. She answered questions about the photos that were submitted.

Mark Fedder reported that he had looked at the windows and deferred the request to the commission. He does not believe the windows are historic to the building.

Ms. Hayward would like to go with a Pella door that is the same series as the windows so that she does not need to alter the size of the transom window above the door.

Chair Kracht said that requests are to include specification sheets for proposed products.

Ms. Hayward wanted time to download the specifications of the windows that she received from her contractor.

MOTION by Mary Russell, seconded by Aaron Bennett to table the request to allow the applicant time to download the specifications.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 4 to 0.

Yes: Bennett, David, Russell, Kracht

No: None

#### **OLD BUSINESS**

#### **HDC-2017-10 – Gary & Cathy Miller, 389 River Street – window replacement**

A request was received from Gary & Cathy Miller, 389 River Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of upper windows and to repair block windows above front entrance at the April 6, 2017 meeting. The Commission tabled action on the replacement of the upper story windows until an inspection is done by the subcommittee and reported back to the commission at the May 4, 2017 meeting. The subcommittee inspected the windows on April 20, 2017. After inspection the subcommittee reconvened at City Hall and drafted a report for the commission for the May 4, 2017 meeting.

Chair Kracht presented her report on the condition of the windows as follows:

1. The wood is sound.
2. The sills are sound.
3. The joints are tight with two exceptions: The lower joint of the upper sashes on two windows show of slight separation of the mortise joint with no recent movement indicated by paint condition and no apparent compromise of functionality.

4. The windows are painted shut.
5. There is no weather stripping.
6. There are no broken or cracked panes
7. The weight cords are all severed.

Commissioner Perschbacher was unable to attend the meeting and sent in a letter that Chair Kracht read into the record (attached).

Commissioner Kracht read the meeting notes from the subcommittee meeting that included the report of findings which read:

Report of Findings 389 River Street upper story windows:

The applicant is provided two options:

Option 1 – The applicant repair the original windows with the option of installing energy efficient glass during the repair process and if desired install new storm windows.

Option 2 – The applicant is allowed to install energy efficient replacement windows as shown to the sub-committee with the condition that the original windows, including any trim pieces, weights and pulleys (if removed) be preserved, labeled and stored on site to allow a future owner the option to repair and replace, similar to the requirement that was placed on the original entrance doors at the Vogue Theater.

Chair Kracht read a portion of the City of Manistee Historic District Commission Guidelines #4 Windows relating to replacement windows.

MOTION by Aaron Bennett, seconded by Brandon David that the Historic District Commission denies the request from Gary & Cathy Miller, 389 River Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of upper windows as submitted with application HDC-2017-10.

With a roll call vote this motion failed 2 to 2.

Yes: Bennett, Kracht  
No: Russell, David

MOTION by Mary Russell, seconded by Aaron Bennett that the applicant is allowed to install energy efficient replacement windows as shown to the sub-committee with the condition that the original windows, including any trim pieces, weights and pulleys (if removed) be preserved, labeled and stored on site to allow a future owner the option to repair and replace, similar to the requirement that was placed on the original entrance doors at the Vogue Theater.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 4 to 0.

Yes: Bennett, Russell, David Kracht  
No: None

### **HDC-2017-16 – Dorothy Hayward, 340 River Street – rear windows and door replacement**

The request from Dorothy Hayward, 340 River Street was tabled earlier to allow her time to download the window and door specifications. Ms. Hayward provided specifications to the commission for windows, due to a printing issued they did not print out everything but they are the same design as the same Pella windows series proposed by Gary and Cathy Miller for their windows she was unable to download the door specifications.

It was noted that in the past the Commission has approved requests by deferring final approval to the Museum Director for items such as doors and windows.

MOTION by Aaron Bennett, seconded by Mary Russell that the Historic District Commission approves the request from Dorothy Hayward, 340 River Street for rear windows and door replacement using Pella Architect Series window and doors with review and approval of the door by the Museum Director.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 4 to 0.

Yes: Russell, Bennett, David, Kracht  
No: None

### **By-Law Amendments**

Due to the late hour the commission will discuss the By-Law Amendments at the June Meeting.

### **PUBLIC COMMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS CONCERNING ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA**

Xavier Verna, Executive Director Ramsdell Regional Center for the Arts – Mr. Verna came to the commission to discuss the lighting that was installed for their new sign. On March 2, 2017 the commission issued a permit to the Ramsdell Theater for the installation of a new sign and lighting. The application showed that the LED Wall Wash Lighting (Grazer) unit was to be installed under the dimensional letters (in the brick channel of the sign area, so it could not be seen from the street). Using low profile black aluminum housing as stated and indicated on the application.

On Monday Xavier called the City because the sign company installed a light bar that protrudes from the building with five supports for the installation of a light bar. Staff recommended that they come back to the commission to discuss the change in lighting.

MOTION by Mary Russell, seconded by Aaron Bennett that the Historic District Commission denies the change in lighting for the signage at the Ramsdell Theater, 101 Maple Street that was part of application HDC-2017-03.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 4 to 0.

Yes: Russell, Bennett, David, Kracht  
No: None

## CORRESPONDENCE

None

## STAFF REPORTS

**Tyler Leppanen, DDA Executive & Economic Development Director** – thanked the commission for upholding the options from the subcommittee

**Denise Blakeslee, Planning & Zoning Administrator** - reported that Mark Fedder, Museum Director had issued a permit to Edgewater for a change in paint colors – ***Issued Permit PHDC17-013***

## MEMBERS DISCUSSION

Commissioner Bennett spoke of the temporary signage that is being used by Love Inc. at 401 River Street, consensus from the commission is that a letter be drafted and sent.

Chair Kracht reported that Commissioner Perschbacher wants a worksession scheduled to discuss duties of the sub- committee and the commission; By-Laws; training; who should be allowed to fill out applications; standards; and the role of the DDA.

The Commissioners discussed dates for the proposed worksession and decided to schedule it at 1:00 pm on Thursday, June 1, 2017 before the regularly scheduled meeting.

The Next meeting of the Historic District Commission will be on Thursday, June 1, 2017 at 3:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers, City Hall, 70 Maple Street.

## ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by Mary Russell, seconded by Aaron Bennett that the meeting be adjourned. Motion passed unanimously.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:50 P.M.

MANISTEE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

---

Denise J. Blakeslee, Recording Secretary



I WILL NOT BE ABLE TO ATTEND THE MAY 4<sup>TH</sup> HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MONTHLY MEETING. I WILL BE AT ANOTHER MEETING NEAR LANSING WHICH BEGINS AT 2:00 P.M. THAT THURSDAY.

HEREIN IS MY REPORT TO THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION BOARD AS I WAS REQUIRED TO DO AS PART OF THE COMMITTEE OF THREE TO VIEW AND INVESTIGATE #389 RIVER STREET, AS PER A QUESTION PLACED ON THE TABLE CONCERNING THE THREE <sup>SECOND</sup> STOREY WINDOWS FRONTING ON RIVER STREET. THESE WINDOWS ARE COMMON 19<sup>TH</sup> CENTURY "DOUBLE HUNG TWO LIGHT GLAZED WOODEN FRAME WINDOWS."

THE QUESTION IS: CAN THE SASHES TO P AND BOTTOM, BE REPLACED WITH MODERN PLASTIC CLAD WOODEN INTERIOR "ENERGY EFFICIENT" ONES? ACCORDING TO THE GUIDELINES, ALL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEMBERS MUST APPLY AND WORK FROM; THE COMMITTEE OF THREE MUST REPORT IF THESE WINDOWS ARE SO DETERIORATED THAT THESE MODERN SASHES CAN BE INSERTED OR ARE THE PRESENT WINDOWS CAPABLE OF BEING RESTORED AS INDICATED BY THE GUIDELINES OF THE DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR?

I FIND THAT, WITHOUT QUESTION, THESE WINDOW FRAMES AND THEIR SASHES ARE TO BE LEFT ALONE, ARE IN EXCELLENT CONDITION, AND MUST NOT BE REPLACED AT ALL.

TO ELABORATE FURTHER:

I OBSERVED THAT THE WOOD SASHES AND FRAMES, AS WELL AS THE EXTERIOR SILLS, SHOW NO DETERIORATION, NO ROT OR DETRIMENTAL ISSUES AT ALL. THESE WINDOWS ARE SO WELL PRESERVED THAT THE ORIGINAL BLOWN GLASS WINDOW-PANES ARE STILL INTACT, WHICH MUST NOT BE LOST.

ONE WINDOW IS WITHOUT ANY OBSERVED PROBLEMS AT ALL - IT IS IN EXCELLENT CONDITION. THE OTHER TWO ARE IN THE SAME EXCELLENT CONDITION EXCEPT FOR A VERY MINOR LOOSENING OR SLIGHT MOVEMENT OF A MORTICE JOINT ON EACH OF THE TWO WINDOWS' TOP SASH AT THE BOTTOM (i.e., THE EASTERNMOST WINDOW UPPER SASH HAS THE LOWER MORTICE JOINT SHOWING MOVEMENT - EASTERN SIDE OF THIS SASH.) THIS IS VERY COMMON IN THESE WINDOWS AND CAN BE REPAIRED. OF COURSE THE TOP SASH CAN BE EASILY AND CAREFULLY REMOVED AND THE JOINT BE PUT IN PLACE AND REPAIRED. HOWEVER, THIS CONDITION HAS DEVELOPED OVER DECADES - THE SLIGHT MOVEMENT AREA IS MUCH PAINTED - SEVERAL COATS - AS IS THE WINDOW BOTH INTERIOR AND EXTERIOR. THE GLASS, ITS GLAZING <sup>(PRETTY)</sup> AND AGE WOULD BE HOLDING IT IN PLACE - THE GLAZING, NOW BEING ROCK HARD AND FIRMLY ATTACHED ON TO THE GLASS AND SASH, SO WITH THE REMOVAL OF ALL GLAZING AND THE ORIGINAL



GLASS PANEL<sup>1</sup> WOULD LIKELY RESULT IN A BROKEN GLASS. THIS MINOR PROBLEM IS EASILY CORRECTED, CERTAINLY HALTED, BY PLACING A RIGHT ANGLE TRIANGLE OF WOOD, SECURED BY ONLY TWO WOOD SCREWS TO THE FRAME TO "HOLD THE JOINT UP." A SIMILAR RIGHT ANGLE WOOD TRIANGLE COULD BE PLACED ON THE OTHER SIDE AS WELL TO BALANCE THIS WINDOW. I'D SUGGEST THESE TRIANGLE PIECES BE PLACED ON THE OTHERS TO MAKE ALL WINDOWS LOOK THE SAME - EVEN IF THEY DON'T NEED IT, WHICH THEY DON'T, BUT IT WOULD BALANCE ALL OF THESE WINDOWS.

IF THESE WINDOWS ARE EXPECTED TO BE OPENED, THE SASH CORDS SHOULD BE REPLACED, AND WITH GREAT CARE, TO PRESERVE THE TRIM AND ALL WINDOW PARTS FROM DAMAGE.

THE PRESENT OWNER EXPRESSES MUCH CONCERN ABOUT "ENERGY EFFICIENCY" AND WANTS TO MAKE THESE WINDOWS "ENERGY EFFICIENT." MY CONSIDERED RECOMMENDATION IS TO LEAVE THESE WINDOWS ALONE ALTOGETHER (EXCEPT FOR APPROVED REPAIR AS OUTLINED ABOVE) AND USE WOODEN CUSTOM MADE STORMS AND "LOW E" OR ANY ENERGY EFFICIENT GLASS TYPE WITH<sup>th</sup> STORMS ALONE AND HAVE THE STORMS MADE TO BE PROPERLY PLACED IN THE PROPER STORM WINDOW GROOVES WHICH THE CURRENT STORMS ARE NOT SO

PROPERLY PLACED.

I DO NOT SUPPORT REMOVAL  
OR REPLACEMENT OF THESE WINDOWS -  
THEY ARE IN EXCELLENT CONDITION.

I REQUEST THAT THIS REPORT  
BE READ IN ITS ENTIRETY TO THE  
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION  
AT THE MAY MEETING AND THEN  
PLACED IN THE MINUTES OF THAT  
MEETING.

THANK YOU.

*John Benschbacher*

VICE CHAIR HISTORIC DISTRICT  
COMMISSION,  
MEMBER OF SUB COMMITTEE  
FOR INSPECTION